

brief treatment of 1 Clement and Ignatius and early Gnosis (ch. xiv), is understandable but leaves the story at a very uncertain stage, with the canonical weight of what were to be recognised as the New Testament documents still far from resolved, and the confrontation with Gnosticism still at a very early stage. And an intriguing final chapter (xv) nominates the fifteen grounds for the success of early Christianity – though, once again, I would have expected more emphasis to be given to the impact made by Jesus himself, his ministry, death and resurrection.

Overall, this volume could be an excellent text book, or volume two at least, for any course on the beginnings of Christianity, a very good example of how a historical study of the period should be undertaken.

DURHAM UNIVERSITY

JAMES D. G. DUNN

Einleitung in das Neue Testament. Berliner Vorlesung im Wintersemester, 1899/1900. Eine Nachschrift von Carl Richard Schenkel. By Adolf Von Harnack (ed. Johann Anselm Steiger with Thomas Illg). Pp. vi + 254 incl. frontispiece and 3 ills. Stuttgart–Bad Cannstatt: Frommann Holzboog, 2014. €148. 978 3 7728 2611 5

JEH (68) 2017; doi:10.1017/S0022046916002682

This welcome edition of Carl Richard Schenkel's 1899/1900 notes from Adolf Harnack's introductory lectures to the New Testament makes publicly accessible for the first time a transcript of Harnack's university lectures. The present edition includes a full transcription of Schenkel's notes, brief afterword and indices. The lecture course itself is divided into two parts: the historical emergence of the New Testament canon and the history of the individual books, which represent, for Harnack, the two principal questions for New Testament research. In the first part, readers will find an outline of Harnack's account of the formation of the New Testament canon that, unsurprisingly, gives significance to the controversies of second-century Gnosticism. In the second part, there is a more intensive presentation of Harnack's quasi-scholastic hypothetical method of inquiry regarding the formation of the individual books of the New Testament. Here readers will find most of the explicit references to Harnack's disagreements with other scholars, such as Baur, Weiss, Renan and Jülicher. Those familiar with Harnack's New Testament research will not be surprised to find his characteristic mixture of traditionalism and radical conjectural criticism present throughout the two parts of his lecture course. In general, the text admirably organises the initially handwritten notes in a clear format, making only one typographical error in the printed Greek (p. 22). As the editors note, this edition will be significant for anyone interested in Harnack's *Wirkungs and Bildungs* historical perspective, especially as it indicates the reception of Harnack's academic teaching. But in addition to offering a privileged snapshot of the celebrated church historian's pedagogy, the lectures provide the possibility of exploring the state of Harnack's New Testament research at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth century, and may even prove to illuminate the development of his famous lectures *Das Wesen des Christentums*. Harnack the New Testament scholar is often obscured by the more prominent (and thus more exhaustively studied) historian of doctrine and public intellectual. But as more of Harnack's *oeuvre* becomes publicly available,

perhaps it will become clearer how Harnack the New Testament scholar and Harnack the historian and public intellectual offer a unified view of religious scholarship in the early twentieth-century German university.

UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA

JONATHAN D. TEUBNER

Beyond Bultmann. Reckoning a New Testament theology. Edited by Bruce W. Longenecker and Mikeal C. Parsons. Pp. x + 372 and 1 table. Waco: Baylor University Press, 2014. £33.50 (paper). 978 1 4813 0041 4
JEH (68) 2017; doi:10.1017/S0022046916002529

Rudolf Bultmann's *Theology of the New Testament*, which shaped generations of students during his lifetime (1886–1976) and beyond, is here revisited by a stellar cast of contributors, eleven of whom each address one of its chapters while two others provide synthetic conclusions.

The general approach is one of critical appreciation, 'critical' being for several contributors the dominant note in relation to a multiply-implausible *ménage à trois* of Troeltschian historicism, Heideggerian ahistorical existentialism and a hyper-Lutheran penchant for dehistoricised Gnostic accounts of salvation by (self-) knowledge. So Udo Schnelle, 'The Kerygma of the Hellenistic Church aside from Paul' (pp. 39–59) both praises and critiques Bultmann's 'extravagant abbreviation' in his almost complete suppression of pre- and non-Pauline Christianity along with his misguided Gnostic history-of-religions grid. Similarly Jörg Frey ('Johannine Christology and eschatology', pp. 101–32) finds Bultmann on John roundly inadequate as either history or exegesis, admirably coherent on its own terms but untenable as a reading of the texts. (See further Samuel Byrskog, 'The message of Jesus', pp. 3–22; C. Kavin Rowe, 'The Kerygma of the earliest Church', pp. 23–37; Richard B. Hays, 'Humanity prior to the revelation of faith', pp. 61–77; Richard Bauckham, 'Dualism and soteriology in Johannine theology', pp. 133–53; Luke Timothy Johnson, 'The rise of church order', pp. 155–72; James D. G. Dunn, 'The development of doctrine', pp. 173–91; Larry W. Hurtado, 'Christology and soteriology', pp. 193–209.) Somewhat distinctively, Wayne A. Meeks ('The problem of Christian living', pp. 211–29) faults the entire exercise of New Testament theology as 'a category mistake'; Bultmann's brittle narrative of decline from Pauline and Johannine peaks, along with his 'self-consuming paradox of the indicative and imperative', is found unsuited to an understanding of early Christian ethics.

In marked contrast, Bultmann's project receives a much warmer welcome from one of his Marburg successors and from Durham. John M. G. Barclay's ('Humanity under faith', pp. 79–99) analysis of Bultmann's systematising account of righteousness, grace, faith and freedom finds it 'a beautifully consistent reading of the whole of Paul' – unmatched by 'anyone alive today' (though supplemented by Barclay on grace as gift without regard to worth). In the first of two concluding essays Angela Standhartinger ('Bultmann's *theology of the New Testament* in context', pp. 233–56) stresses Bultmann's political context and legacy, culminating in Dorothee Sölle. Francis Watson ('Bultmann and the theological interpretation of Scripture', pp. 257–72), finally, discerns in Bultmann's notion of kerygma and his soteriological theology of fallenness, salvation-event and faith an eminently theological